

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Minutes of the 6th Meeting of the Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Date : 1 March 2011 (Tuesday)
Time : 10:30 a.m.
Venue : Conference Room, Hong Kong Arts Development Council
14/F, East Warwick House, Taikoo Place,
Quarry Bay, Hong Kong

Attendees:

Chairman

Professor Stephen CHEUNG Yan-leung, B.B.S., J.P.

Members

Mr. CHENG Chi-ming
Mr. Derek HUNG Chiu-wah
Ms. KO Po-ling, M.H., J.P.
Mr. Bankee KWAN Pak-hoo
Mr. LAM Ying Kit
The Honourable LEE Wing-tat
Mr. William LEUNG Wing-cheung, B.B.S., J.P.
Mr. Charles Peter MOK
Mr. TAI Hay-lap, B.B.S., J.P.
Dr. John TSE Wing-ling, M.H.
Mr. Coleman WAI Ching
Ms. Ada WONG Ying-kay, J.P.

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

| | |
|------------------|---|
| Mr. Garmen CHAN | Executive Director, Communications and Marketing |
| Dr. CHAN Man-wai | Executive Director, Project Delivery |

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Dr. Lars NITTVÉ Executive Director, M+

Mr. Louis YU Kwok-lit Executive Director,
Performing Arts

Secretary

Ms. Stella WONG Assistant Public Relations Manager

(The following representatives attended only the discussion of Agenda Item 3)

Analysis and Reporting Consultant

Professor Peter YUEN Principal Investigator,
Public Policy Research Institute,
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Dr. Anthony LOK Project Manager,
Public Policy Research Institute,
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Dr. Vincent LAW Project Fellow,
Public Policy Research Institute,
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Absent with apologies :

The Honourable Ronald ARCULLI, G.B.M., G.B.S., J.P.

Dr. Allan ZEMAN, G.B.S., J.P.

Mr. HUNG Keung

Ms. Ida LAM Choi-chu

Mr. Victor LO Chung-wing, G.B.S., J.P.

Dr. MAN Ying-ling

The Honourable Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr. YAU Wing-kwong

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Action
Parties

Opening Remarks

1. The Chairman welcomed Members to the sixth meeting of the Consultation Panel (CP). He, in particular, welcomed the presence of Mr. Garmen CHAN, Executive Director, Communications and Marketing, Dr CHAN Man-wai, Executive Director, Project Delivery, Dr. Lars NITTVE, Executive Director, M+ and Mr. Louis YU, Executive Director, Performing Arts, at the meeting. He also introduced the attending analysis and reporting consultant representatives, Professor Peter YUEN, Principal Investigator of the Public Policy Research Institute (PPRI) of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Dr. Anthony LOK, Project Manager of the PPRI and Dr. Vincent LAW, Project Fellow of the PPRI. He also thanked Mr. Michael HUI Wah-kit and Mr. Oscar HO Hing-kay for their contribution and work for the Consultation Panel and welcomed Mr. HUNG Keung, Mr. LAM Ying Kit and Mr. Coleman WAI Ching to be Members of the CP.

Agenda Item (1) Confirmation of the Minutes of the 5th Consultation Panel Meeting

2. Mr. Coleman WAI Ching raised a textual amendment for paragraph no. 28 of the draft minutes in Chinese.
3. The Chairman said that there were no other amendment proposals from Members and the meeting confirmed the minutes of the fifth meeting.

Agenda Item (2) Matters Arising

4. The Chairman said there were no matters arising from the minutes of the last meeting.

Agenda Item (3) Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 2 Public Engagement (PE) Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District submitted by the Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University (WKCDA CP/01/2011)

5. The Chairman said that the three-month Stage 2 PE exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) ended on 20 November 2010. The

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

purpose of the Stage 2 PE exercise was to gauge public views on whether the proposals of the Conceptual Plan Consultants had addressed mainstream comments received in the Stage 1 PE exercise and on their preferences for individual features of the three proposed plans. The West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCD) received comments and views on the three Conceptual Plan Options and on different features of the Conceptual Plan Options.

6. The Chairman reported that Dr. YAU Wing-kwong, who could not attend the meeting, had requested the Chairman to share with Members on how the WKCD had incorporated comments from Members raised in the last meeting regarding the Stage 2 PE exercise. He reported that suggestions from Members had been considered and incorporated in the Stage 2 PE exercise, including providing more support for youth and organising more interactive activities for students, such as guided tours for secondary students and seminars for university students. In addition, the WKCD had also addressed concern raised by Members on engaging the disabled and ethnic minorities in the Stage 2 PE exercise by arranging guided tours for them. The WKCD had also produced video introducing the Conceptual Plan Options and the Stage 2 PE exercise and distributed DVDs to community centres.

7. The Chairman also reported that due to time and resource constraints, the WKCD was unable to incorporate some of the suggestions from Members, including developing mobile applications, which involved months for development; organising activities in the WKCD site for it was too costly to put up temporary structures there; hiring mobile trucks for roving exhibition, which involved many technical issues, including expensive charges, parking and switching off of idling engines during exhibition.

8. The Chairman also reported that many people participated in the Stage 2 PE exercise. The WKCD received about 7,000 completed questionnaires and half of the respondents were under the age of 30. He thanked Mr. TAI Hay-lap for assisting the WKCD in arranging thousands of students to the roving exhibition. In addition, the WKCD had also arranged focus group meetings for the arts and culture stakeholders and development-related professionals and listened to their views on the Conceptual Plan Options.

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Briefing sessions on findings of the Stage 2 PE exercise had been arranged for Members of the WKCDA Board, Committees and CP on 25 March 2011.

(Ms. Ada WONG Ying-Kay arrived at 10:47 a.m.)

9. Professor Peter YUEN gave a PowerPoint presentation on the Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 2 PE Exercise (the Report). Copies of the slides were distributed at the meeting.

(Hon LEE Wing-Tat arrived at 11:12 a.m.)

10. The Chairman said that during the Stage 2 PE exercise, the WKCDA held a roving exhibition and exit polls at six locations across the territory, 12 forums and nine focus group meetings. About 30,000 visitors had viewed the display of the three Conceptual Plan Options at the roving exhibition with 32 guided tours held for stakeholder groups, including arts and culture stakeholders, professional institutes, the disabled, ethnic minority groups, Legislative Council members, Yau Tsim Mong District Council, Consulates and Chambers of Commerce. Under a special programme suggested by Members, the WKCDA conducted forums and school tours to solicit views from students and youth, who would be the main users of the WKCD. Around 4,000 students from 78 schools visited the exhibitions.

11. Mr. TAI Hay-lap said that the Report was very detailed and would like to explore the relationship between the views collected and the final decision made by the WKCDA Board in the selection process of the preferred option and the elements which would be taken into consideration.

12. The Hon. LEE Wing-tat raised the issue of consultation fatigue of the public regarding the WKCD project as there would be another round of consultation in the near future. He queried if the public would be willing to respond to the consultation questions.

13. Ms. KO Po-ling expressed that the handling of flagged cases by the PPRI was very cautious. The participation of youth in the Stage 2 PE exercise was encouraging and in line with the goal of the CP. She shared Mr. TAI Hay-lap's views on the way forward for the Stage 3 PE exercise and was

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

concerned about moving on for the next stage of the PE exercise. She also suggested developing mobile applications for the Stage 3 PE exercise as this channel could reach out to more people.

(Ms. KO Po-ling left at 11:30 a.m.)

14. Mr. Derek HUNG Chiu-wah expressed his concern on the Special Committee set up by the PPRI in handling the flagged cases and the difference between the results of the flagged cases and the results from the exit polls. He was also concerned to know if more information on financial arrangement and detailed design would be disclosed in the Stage 3 PE exercise.

15. The Chairman said that the Report provided reference for the Selection Panel, set up by the WKCDA Board, in considering the Conceptual Plan Options. He also said that Professor Peter YUEN had briefed Members of the Selection Panel about the findings of the Report and views of the public on the three Conceptual Plan Options. The Selection Panel would also take into account the technical feasibility, phasing and financial implication of the Conceptual Plan Options. He also said that public opinion was a very important input in the selection process and the consultation results were very useful though there might be consultation fatigue. Regarding the development of mobile applications, the WKCDA would definitely take into consideration as it could help reach more people.

16. The Chairman also expressed that Professor Peter YUEN was very experienced in handling the flagged cases and there were other sets of data for triangulation. In the Stage 2 PE exercise, the WKCDA had also consulted the public about their views on each Conceptual Plan Option. He also said the desirable features of the other two Conceptual Plan Options would be considered for incorporation into the preferred option as appropriate.

17. Professor Peter YUEN explained that there were over 20 members in the team in handling the views collected during the Stage 2 PE exercise. The Special Committee set up to look into the flagged cases was formed by five senior researchers, including Professor Peter YUEN, Professor LEE Ngok, Dr. Vincent LAW, Dr. Anthony LOK and Dr. King CHONG. The Special Committee examined case by case when abnormalities were found in the

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

completed questionnaires. After due consideration, the Special Committee of the PPRI decided to adopt the current approach instead of invalidating the flagged cases in the analysis.

18. Mr. CHENG Chi-ming asked if the WKCDA had not given sufficient regard to software development, it would be meaningless to talk about hardware. He would like to know what the strategy and governance of the WKCDA would be. He also said that the questionnaire was of high quality but the visitor flow of 30,000 for six exhibitions was not satisfactory. He expressed that the exhibitions should be visited by more people and the WKCDA should consider venues with better access for the future PE exercise.

19. Mr. Bankee KWAN Pak-hoo raised his concern on the transparency of the selection criteria for the preferred Conceptual Plan Option.

20. Dr. John TSE Wing-ling expressed that the visitor flow of 30,000 in 3 months was not satisfactory and views of the general public, who might not have visited the exhibition, had not be included. He also said that the PPRI should show the final overall mean score of each option. In addition, he also raised concern on how the WKCDA would incorporate the desirable features of the Conceptual Plan Options which were not selected, and he expressed that public should be provided with information on that.

21. Ms. Ada WONG Ying-kay recapped that in the last CP meeting, the issue of more involvement for the arts and cultural sector was raised. However, in the Stage 2 PE exercise, arts and culture stakeholders were given three minutes in a forum and this arrangement undermined the quality of professional inputs. She expressed that the views of architects and urban planners were not found in the qualitative data of the report. She requested the WKCDA to ascertain the weighting of the views from general public and that of the professional and arts and culture stakeholders.

22. Mr. Louis YU Kwok-lit, Executive Director, Performing Arts, expressed that the WKCDA had started work on software development. Focus group and individual meetings with the arts and culture stakeholders had been organised. The WKCDA noted that talent nurturing was also very important and had initiated action in this area.

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

23. Dr. Lars NITTVÉ said that he took up the job because the visual art part of this project was definitely driven by software and ideas. He said that museum was not the same as a building and it had a relationship between its content and the audiences. The museum building was a tool and everything took place in a museum was educational. He and his team were in dialogue with the stakeholders, including artists, curators and art practitioners, through various means, and the team would build a vision on what M+ would be. The vision would be about the collection strategy, the building needed, staffing etc. He said that M+ was a project which was completely software driven.

24. The Chairman also said that the WKCDA should focus on audience building, in particular, on how to nurture secondary students to appreciate arts. The WKCDA would continue to find ways to work with stakeholders.

25. Professor Peter YUEN explained that an overall score for each option by summing up all the scores was not generated, as the questions in the questionnaire were correlating to each other and a simple addition of all scores would lead to duplication.

26. Dr. CHAN Man-wai said the selection criteria included meeting planning design principles, meeting community and stakeholders aspirations, design and phasing flexibility, technical strengths and weaknesses, financial implications, and fulfilling key planning and development requirements. He also expressed that ICAC had been consulted on the selection mechanism.

27. Mr. Louis YU Kwok-lit said that more than 20 focus group meetings were held during the Stage 2 PE exercise with stakeholders in addition to the public forums. The views of the arts and culture stakeholders expressed in the focus group meetings were captured by the PPRI, which were analysed and reflected in the Report. Staff of the Performing Arts Department had also attended the focus group meetings for the stakeholders to listen to views and reported to the Selection Panel for consideration.

28. Dr. CHAN Man-wai said that the Performing Arts Committee and Museum Committee had discussed the three Conceptual Plan Options and reported to the Selection Panel.

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

29. Ms. Ada WONG Ying-kay asked if the said reports could be released. The Chairman said that he would raise the request to the WKCDA and he believed that transparency was very important.
30. Mr. CHENG Chi-ming said that he was happy that the Performing Arts Department and Museum Department of the WKCDA were moving forward. However, he was worried that the project was still in the consultation stage and no decision was made after two years of consultation. In the coming PE exercise, the WKCDA should provide the public with a direction and there should be more concrete ideas in the Stage 3 PE exercise.
31. The Chairman said that he believed that the WKCDA management would come up with solutions, for both hardware and software, shortly.
32. Ms. Ada WONG Ying-kay said that the WKCDA should consider simplifying the Stage 3 PE exercise, which would be held later this year, and more concrete content should be shown to the public. She said that she had been following up on the project for eight years and consultation on the principles of the project was still going on.
33. Mr. TAI Hay-lap said that more concrete content was required for the Stage 3 PE exercise. More holistic approach was needed in the coming PE exercise, including releasing information on the criteria set by the WKCDA, relationship of the analysis of views and the selection. In addition, the weighting or priority should be set out clearly. He was happy to hear that the project was software driven and he urged the WKCDA to be proactive and clear. He also expressed that nurturing of talents and audience building were important.
34. Dr. John TSE Wing-ling expressed that the public would like to know more details of the project, but not merely consultation.
35. Mr. Derek HUNG Chiu-wah said that the WKCDA should put more effort on talent nurturing and audience building. In addition, the WKCDA should let the public know the factors that had been taken into consideration in the consultation.

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

36. Mr. Bankee KWAN Pak-hoo said that the public would no longer be patient and it was time for the WKCDA to take action. He raised the concern that the general public might find the planning design principles and technical assessment too technical. When selecting the preferred Conceptual Plan Option, the WKCDA should balance stakeholders' interest, public interest and the budget. The weighting of the public views and other factors in the selection process should be released in order to make the consultation meaningful.

37. Mr. Coleman WAI Ching expressed his concern on software development. He said that the timeline for software and hardware development should go hand in hand, otherwise it would be a waste of time and resources. He also said that the Stage 2 PE exercise focused on the general public but not the stakeholders and the WKCDA should also consider views from the stakeholders as well.

(Mr. Bankee KWAN Pak-hoo left at 12:10 p.m.)

38. Mr. William LEUNG Wing-cheung said that the arts and culture market in Hong Kong was very small. With the training provided by the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts in the past 20 years, there was excess supply of talents, who might have taken up different jobs in the community. He suggested that the WKCDA should consider the readily available talents for the project and provide them with additional training.

39. The Hon LEE Wing-tat said that the WKCDA should try to reach out to and interact with the general public. The WKCDA should come up with cultural activities to interact with the public now, but not merely focused on hardware development.

40. Mr. Derek HUNG Chiu-wah suggested that the WKCDA should consider some performances, similar to that of the Stage 1 PE exercise, for the Stage 3 PE exercise at some major venues.

41. The Chairman said that he would relay the views from Members to the management team of the WKCDA. He also agreed with the views of

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Members on software development and the management team should work on a holistic development plan for the project.

42. Mr. Louis YU Kwok-lit reported that his team was planning for public programme at the WKCD site, which would be held by end of 2011 and would be co-organised with arts and culture stakeholders. He also said that he hoped to get support from community leaders, for example, District Council, for the programme. Discussion with tertiary institutions which organize arts and culture programmes had started as nurturing talents would be a long-term task. As such, he expected that suitable talents would be in place when the WKCD started operation. He also said focus group meetings for the professionals from the arts and culture sectors were held to discuss in detail on the positioning of the 15 performance venues, strategy on artist-in-residence etc. The WKCDA would move forward on these issues in the Stage 3 PE exercise and try to collect more views from the professionals.

43. Dr. Lars NITTVE confirmed that there would definitely be a timeline for software development. The only way to make M+ successful was what the museum would be used for. The construction of the project in fact put pressure on his team on when to finalize the content of M+. He also expressed that nurturing talents was very important and collaboration with local and overseas institutions was required. He said that M+ could be “opened” way before there would be a building and could start a programme which would be valuable for the audiences and practitioners in Hong Kong within a year’s time.

44. Dr. CHAN Man-wai said that the management team was working on both hardware and software development. In terms of transparency for the selection process, public views were important and the WKCDA had set out six major selection criteria, including technical assessment and planning.

(Agenda Item (3) ended at 12:20)

Agenda Item (4): Other Matters

45. The Hon. LEE Wing-tat raised his concern on the resignation of the Chief Executive Officer. He expressed that the public had expectation on the

Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

WKCD and would require the WKCD to be transparent and accountable. He also said that the WKCD should have a firmer position and he understood that the WKCD was in the process of seeking more information on the issue. He also expressed that more information should be released to the public if it would not violate the law and intrude privacy.

46. The Chairman said that he understood the concern of Members on the issue and would relay the views to the WKCD.

47. Mr. LAM Ying-kit raised his concern on talent nurturing especially for children and he suggested that the WKCD should start nurturing the children and young people by encouraging them to visit the theatres more often. He also suggested that the WKCD could consider sourcing sponsorship from tycoons on show tickets for children and young people. He said that it would be more effective in terms of audience building for children which would contribute to the culture development in Hong Kong.

48. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:25 p.m. The Secretariat would contact Members to fix the date of the seventh meeting.

The Secretariat of the Consultation Panel of
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority
March 2011